The Truth of Dokdo-6 - 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)' and Usando -

Dokdo Research Institute of Sejong University

1. Dokdo described in Volume 5 of 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)(1756)'

The Volume 5 of 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)(1756)' written by Shin Gyeong-jun (申景濬: 1712-1781), a civil official who developed geography in the late Joseon Dynasty, de scribes Dokdo as below.

Yeojiji(=The Record of Geography of Joseon, 1656) describes that Usan and Ulleung was originally one island, according to one report. However, they may be considered as two different islands according to various maps. One is the island called Matsushima and both islands are together referred to as Usanguk(=the Usan Nation). (按奥地志云 一說于山欝陵 本一島 而考諸圖志 二島 也 一則其所謂松島 而蓋二島 俱是于山國也)

羅界話表之五 唐礼后至舍房房 你不一件明一住武一出一 鼠 老之奉御宜你大張:為

Volume 5 of 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)(1756)'

Similar contents were found in three Joseon official books which are 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo)

復書 居民矣 得到 **直以解續發船為言** 考方物逮至我朝 局也介於慶尙江原 待只令東萊府使朴慶業答書曰足下非不知此島之橫占 探礒竹島形止且曰島在慶尙江原之間朝廷惡其猥越不 至 **矲越窺覘是誠何心恐非鄰好之道所謂礒竹島實我國之** 一面還同行 成宗三 z 前以 巳 前 地地 |年有告別|| 有日 于志 所復 山云 往書 則翻 同利逃民个雖廢棄豈可容他人冒居乎 復之 海洋載在輿 倭陵 不幾於輕朝廷而昧道理乎貴島於我 也說 所于 |峯島者乃遣朴元宗往見之因風 郞 謂山 P 极皆 |悉梗槩貴島宜瞿然改圖| 島于 (地焉可誣也蓋自羅麗以 (取大竹大鰒魚囘啓云島 也山 光海七年倭差船 一隻謂將 而 令來 家取 鬱陵 一乃欲 · 許 接 濤 或 他 中 往 H 無

(1770),' 'The Book of Ten Thousand Techniques of Governance(=Mangi Yoram) (1808),' and 'The Augmented Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon(=Jeungbo Munheon Bigo) (1908)' as follows. According to Yeojiji, Ulleung and Usan are the territories of Usanguk. That is to say, Usan is referred to as Matsushima by Japan (Matsushima=Dokdo).

'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)(1756)' is a very important record because it corrects the contents of 'The Revised and Augmented Survey Geography of Joseon (=Shinjeung Dongguk Yeoji Seungram : 1530)', indicating that Ulleungdo and Usando are 'one island.' The phrase 'Usan and Ulleung was originally one island, according to one report' of 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego : 1756)' and is the citation 'Yeojiji' quoted in 'The Revised and Augmented Survey Geography of Joseon (=Shinjeung Dongguk Yeoji Seungram).' In addition, it is assumed that 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)' also recorded this part as a quotation of 'Yeojiji.'

This is due to the fact that the first literature indicating that Ulleungdo and Usando is 'one island' is not 'Yeojiji' but 'The Revised and Augmented Survey Geography of Joseon (=Shinjeung Dongguk Yeoji Seungram).'

Although 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)(1756)' quoted 'Yeojiji (興地志),' it is not possible to confirm the original copies because most of contents of 'Yeojiji (1656),' including the phrase related to Ulleungdo and Usando, do not exist today.

However, the records of 'Ganggyeogo' that quoted 'Yeojiji' were inherited by three Joseon official books which are 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo : 1770)', 'The Book of Ten Thousand Techniques of Governance(=Mangi Yoram : 1808),' and 'The Augmented Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon(=Jeungbo Munheon Bigo : 1908).'

Consequently, the contents of 'The Revised and Augmented Survey

Geography of Joseon (=Shinjeung Dongguk Yeoji Seungram),' published in 1530, indicating that Ulleungdo and Usando is 'one island,' are clearly corrected by 'Yeojiji (興地志),' written in 1656; According to this literature, Ulleungdo and Usando are not 'one island' but 'two islands.'

2. Distortion of facts by Japan

Japan offered a critical opinion about the phrase of 'According to Yeojiji, Usan is referred to as Matsushima (=Dokdo) by Japan' mentioned in three Joseon official books which are 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo)', 'The Book of Ten Thousand Techniques of Governance(=Mangi Yoram)' and 'The Augmented Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon(=Jeungbo Munheon Bigo).'

It is assumed that Japan is distorting the truth because they feel the necessity of criticism over Korean literature that clearly indicates Usando is Matsushima, that is to say, Dokdo.

Japan is insistent on distorting that the phrase of 'Usan is referred to as Matsushima (=Dokdo) by Japan' was fabricated by Shin Gyeong-jun. In order to refute the opinions of Japan, we need to review them thoroughly.

* Distorted opinions of Professor Simojo Masao (下條正男) of Takushoku University)

(1) According to 'Yeojiji,' that is to say, the explanatory note of 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo),' Ulleung and Usan are the territory of Usanguk. 'Yeojiji (輿地志),' which is the source of this phrase, is the literature published by 'Yu Seong-won (柳聲遠)' in 1656.

However, there are a couple of problems, as follows ; First, the quoted part

cannot be confirmed because 'Yeojiji' does not exist now. Second, there is a possibility that the phrase might be distorted because 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon(=Dongguk Munheon Bigo)' was written by not quoting 'Yeojiji' but by referring to other books.

(2) Records of May 16th in 1756, 'The Annals of King Yeongjo(=Yeongjo Silrok):' The phrase that provides an evidence for 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon(=Dongguk Munheon Bigo)' is also found in 'The Historical Geographies(=Ganggyego : 1756, 彊界考)' of Shin Gyeong-jun (申景 ^{*}). In addition, it was recorded that Shin Gyeong-jun was responsible for the publication of 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo).'

Therefore, 'Yeojiji' of Yu Seong-won (柳聲遠) was quoted in 'The Historical Geographies(=Ganggyego)' of Shin Gyeong-jun. Then, it was quoted in 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo)' again. Meanwhile, the description in 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)' is as below.

<u>"Yeojiji describes that Usan and Ulleung was one island, according to one</u> report. However, they may be considered as two different islands according to various maps. One is the island called Matsushima (=Dokdo) and the two islands, together, are the Nation of Usan(=Usanguk)."

'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo)' quoted that "Ulleung and Usan are the territories of Usanguk according to Yeojiji. However, according to 'Ganggyeogo' which provides the evidence for the sentence mentioned in the previous sentence, the phrase 'Usan and Ulleung are originally one island according to one report' was written before the sentence but omitted in 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo).'

In other words, Shin Gyeong-jun distorted the original sentence by omitting the phrase 'Usan and Ulleung are originally one island according to one report' quoted from 'Yeojiji' and writing his personal opinion that "<u>they</u> <u>may be considered as two different islands according to various maps</u>" on 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)'.

(3) The opinion of Korea that Usando is Matsushima (=Dokdo) and Dokdo belongs to Ulleungdo originated from the fabrication of Shin Gyeong-jun. Therefore, the Korean government's assertion for the sovereignty of Dokdo has no reasonable evidence.

[Source:『Takeshima, its Historical and Territorial Issues (竹島、その歴史と領土問題)』(下條正 男, 2005)]

3. Refutation for the Distorted Opinions of Japan

When interpreting the phrase of 'The Historical Geographies (=Ganggyego)', Professor Simojo concluded that the phrase quoted from 'Yeojiji' is 'Yeojiji describes that Usan and Ulleung are one island according to one report'.

However, such conclusion has no evidence, because there is no comma or period but all sentences are connected in the original literature written in Chinese characters.

There is a high possibility that the sentence, <However they may be considered as two different islands according to various maps. One is the island called Matsushima and the two islands, together, are referred to as Usanguk' following the phrase 'Yeojiji describes that Usan and Ulleung are originally one island according to one report'> is a quotation from 'Yeojiji.' Three official books of Joseon which are 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo)', 'The Book of Ten Thousand Techniques of Governance(=Mangi Yoram),' and 'The Augmented Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon(=Jeungbo Munheon Bigo)' were organized using this phrase.

There is no evidence for Professor Simojo's conclusion that the latter phrase was fabricated by Shin Gyeong-jun. It is a just distortion due to conclusion of the Simojo group. Korean scholars and some Japanese scholars are well aware of the distortion method of the Simojo group.

Then, why is the phrase 'Usan and Ulleung are originally one island according to one report' omitted in the three books including 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon(=Dongguk Munheon Bigo).' In fact, this phrase is a quotation not from 'Yeojiji' but from 'The Revised and Augmented Survey Geography of Joseon(=Shinjeung Dongguk Yeoji Seungram : 1530).' Therefore, those books, such as 'The Reference Compilation of Documents on Joseon (=Dongguk Munheon Bigo)', were written by organizing the sentences quoted from 'Yeojiji,' which has solid evidences.

Such interpretation is a reasonable one. As a result, the opinion of Professor Simojo has no logical evidences but is just an absurd insistence which cannot be reasonably established.